

THE EFFECTIVENESS OF ONLINE COLLABORATIVE LEARNING ON STUDENT WRITING SKILL

¹Uci Nur Maulidah ²Imam Nur Aziz

The Institute Keislaman Abdullah Faqih

mauliye67@gmail.com imamnuraziz@gmail.com

Accepted: August, 12 th 2020	reviewed: September 11 th 2020	Published: November 20 th 2020
--	--	--

Abstract: Online collaborative learning is learning that focuses on group cohesiveness with the success of the process. The inspiration that drives this assessment is to investigate the impact of the use of online collaborative learning on students' ability to write descriptive texts. it's done in MTS. BUSTANUL ULUM in the second class of juniors to find out whether online collaborative learning is effective learning, researchers used pre-experimental methods where information was calculated using the statistical formula of the T-test. the consequence of exploration was that the mean of the pre-test was 60.4063, and the mean of the post-test was 84.4688. From the questionnaire, there were students who agreed with the online collaborative learning method that had helped them in writing descriptive text. It can be concluded that student achievement increases when they are educated by collaborative learning online.

Keyword: online collaborative learning, writing, descriptive text.

INTRODUCTION

The worrying dropout rate of schools and study programs has an impact on the educational context this year. Writing ability is one of the factors for writing progress to improve the quality of academic writing. ¹ In teaching English, writing is still part of the syllabus ". ² Writing is the practice of composing words in which individuals express their feelings, thoughts, sentiments, and beliefs. ³ Writing in a readable form may be used as a contact medium. Writing can improve the critical thinking of students. ⁴ In general, by having students arrange, summarize, and incorporate and synthesize diverse components into a cohesive whole, writing will teach critical thinking. ⁵ As mentioned ⁶ that "when students complain about how difficult it is to write in a second language, they talk not only about the difficulty of putting the right words and using the correct grammar but also about the difficulty of finding and expressing ideas in a new language."⁷

Online collaborative learning to develop knowledge-building processes, interaction, and

¹ Émilie Tremblay-Wragg et al., "Writing More, Better, Together: How Writing Retreats Support Graduate Students through Their Journey," *Journal of Further and Higher Education* 00, no. 00 (2020): 1–12, <https://doi.org/10.1080/0309877X.2020.1736272>.

² Yanuarti Apsari, "Reflective Reading Journal in Teaching Writing," *Indonesian EFL Journal* 4, no. 2 (2018): 39, <https://doi.org/10.25134/ieflj.v4i2.1374>.

³ (Rizki, Nouvaldi, and Apsari, 2020)

⁴ Imam Nur Aziz, "The Concept of Language Environment : A Descriptive Study At Madrasah Aliyah Keagamaan Gresik," *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* 53, no. 9 (2013): 1689–99.

⁵ Masoumeh Shiri Aminloo, "The Effect of Collaborative Writing on EFL Learners Writing Ability at Elementary Level," *Journal of Language Teaching and Research* 4, no. 4 (2013): 801–6, <https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.4.4.801-806>.

⁶ Jawaher Alsubaie and Ali Ashuraidah, "Exploring Writing Individually and Collaboratively Using Google Docs in EFL Contexts," *English Language Teaching* 10, no. 10 (2017): 10, <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v10n10p10>.

⁷ Imam Nur Aziz and Yuli Ani Setyo Dewi, "The Concept of Language Environment: A Descriptive Study at Madrasah Aliah Keagamaan Gresik," *EDUKASI: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 7, no. 2 (2019): 1–23.

student participation in the learning environment.⁸ The learning took place during several meetings consisting of discussion forums and designing projects in the social media environment.⁹ Collaborative learning is not just an exchange of data from teachers to students, but the presentation of students with new concepts that are in the domain of their understanding.¹⁰ In collaborative learning, the metacognitive abilities of members are taken into account without the assistance of the professor during the process; students must turn to one another, or outside sources, to overcome boundaries, empowering recognition of their wrong assumptions. Cross-cultural collaborative learning builds knowledge through interaction,¹¹ builds teamwork, engages in group assignments, and negotiates with peers and online classroom instructors.¹² This gives students the opportunity to be critical of their own views, respond to different and challenging views of peers, and to have a shared understanding.¹³ This strategy is an effective activity that can help students write well without fearing being wrong because doing it in groups and making students more enthusiastic about learning from mistakes.

Finally, the researcher selected 32 students in second grade at MTs Bustanul Ulum who had difficulty understanding text descriptive writing skills in the teaching and learning process using the WhatsApp group to develop their writing skills.

REVIEW OF LITERATURE

A. Collaborative learning

Collaborative learning takes place in a "learning atmosphere in which individual learners support and contribute to a group's emerging knowledge pool; stresses peer interactions as learners work together to build learning groups"¹⁴. The term "collaborative learning" refers to the theory of learning by¹⁵, precisely the proximal growth zone (ZPD) in which during this learning phase a mutual understanding can be established. "In the online world, "...collaborative learning involves the same basic characteristics as collaborative on-site learning, but usually unfolds differently"¹⁶.

Terms also used interchangeably are group learning and co-operative learning. Although the words have identical meanings, there are distinct distinctions. "As the teacher may

⁸ Xusen Cheng et al., "An Experimental Study of Satisfaction Response: Evaluation of Online Collaborative Learning," *International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning* 17, no. 1 (2016): 60–78, <https://doi.org/10.19173/irrodl.v17i1.2110>.

⁹ Wenting Chen and Shulin Yu, "Implementing Collaborative Writing in Teacher-Centered Classroom Contexts: Student Beliefs and Perceptions," *Language Awareness* 0, no. 0 (2019): 1–21, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09658416.2019.1675680>.

¹⁰ Ismael Challob, Nadzrah Abu Bakar, and Hafizah Latif, "Collaborative Blended Learning Writing Environment: Effects on EFL Students' Writing Apprehension and Writing Performance" 9, no. 6 (2016): 229–41, <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v9n6p229>.

¹¹ (Nykopp, Marttunen, and Erkens, 2019)

¹² Jimmy Zambrano et al., "Effects of Group Experience and Information Distribution on Collaborative Learning," *Instructional Science*, no. 0123456789 (2019), <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11251-019-09495-0>.

¹³ Khalil Motallebzadeh and Farideh Samadi, "The Effect of Using Online Collaborative Tasks on Incidental Vocabulary Learning of Impulsive vs. Reflective Iranian EFL Learners," *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature* 6, no. 6 (2017): 127, <https://doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.6n.6p.127>.

¹⁴ M G Moore and G Kearsley, "Distance Education: A Systems View of Online Learning (3. Baskı). New York: Cengage," *Muhasebe ve Vergi Uygulamaları Dergisi*, 2012.

¹⁵ Lev S Vygotsky, "Mind in Society (M. Cole, V. John-Steiner, S. Scribner, & E. Soubberman, Eds.))" (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1978).

¹⁶ Elizabeth F Barkley, K Patricia Cross, and Claire H Major, *Collaborative Learning Techniques: A Handbook for College Faculty* (John Wiley & Sons, 2014).

assume, online community practices do not "automatically result in interactive experiences" or online collab

This technical determinism is collaborative learning that has a side effect on the emergence of modern and emerging technological channels or is the belief when students interact far more, there will eventually' ¹⁷.

The role of the teacher is "important in the improvement of processes of efficient cooperation" ¹⁸ Most for ongoing probes emphasis on online collaborative learning all about learning to teachers, especially online collaborative learning from a student viewpoint, the resources used to facilitate collaborative learning, and the ability of instructors to adapt to student need to provide these learning opportunities ¹⁹centered on evaluating the preparation of learners Collaborative learning assisted by machine (CSCL) by the growth of a system Incentives for interactive learning, collaborative behaviors, and online learning skills measurement. Additional areas of the Latest analysis have been provided with the use of social media, Mendeley, and interactive worlds, investigating what students are doing collaborate, If academic student success is enhanced, and how or not instruments assist Students in the interactive Learning online ²⁰

A void the latest science issues the experiences of Faculty on the application of collective learning online. There is a need for additional study with greater exposure to how to support the willingness of teachers to apply innovative and collaborative working practices "There is also a need to provide teachers with unique tools to orchestrate collaborative teaching practices, encourage these methods in institutional and work culture, and a "need to emphasize the autonomy of the skills of teachers to implement innovative and collaborative working methods" ²¹

B. Online learning

"The junction of distance education, human-computer interaction, educational technology, and cognitive science lies in online education". Another facet to be included in this list is instructional architecture. The guidance from the classroom sets the. The norm for offering online classes that provide academic quality and integrate "sound cognitive and educational values" ²².

External encounters with classmates and professors during a typical facial expression course were usually translated into email addresses, conversations, and forums while online learning was in the early 1990s, with far less overall interaction ²³ There was no time or space for constructive engagement and teamwork in these content-heavy, independent research classes.

The online classroom teacher can consider the prerequisite knowledge possessed by the pupil in a learner-centered sense ²⁴. In a constructivist learning environment, these prerequisite strengths

¹⁷ Trena M Paulus, Rebecca Payne, and Lisa Jahns, "'Am I Making Sense Here?': What Blogging Reveals about Undergraduate Student Understanding," *Educational Psychology & Counseling Publications and Other Works*, 2009, 2.

¹⁸ Raija Hämäläinen and Katja Vähäsantanen, "Theoretical and Pedagogical Perspectives on Orchestrating Creativity and Collaborative Learning," *Educational Research Review* 6, no. 3 (2011): 169–84.

¹⁹ Neus Capdeferro and Margarida Romero, "Are Online Learners Frustrated with Collaborative Learning Experiences?," *International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning* 13, no. 2 (2012): 26–44.

²⁰ Waleed Al-Rahmi, Mohd Shahizan Othman, and Lizawati Mi Yusuf, "The Role of Social Media for Collaborative Learning to Improve Academic Performance of Students and Researchers in Malaysian Higher Education," *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning* 16, no. 4 (2015).

²¹ Hämäläinen and Vähäsantanen, "Theoretical and Pedagogical Perspectives on Orchestrating Creativity and Collaborative Learning."

²² Jorge Larreamendy-Joerns and Gaea Leinhardt, "Going the Distance with Online Education," *Review of Educational Research* 76, no. 4 (2006): 567–605.

²³ Jan Van Bruggen, "Theory and Practice of Online Learning," *British Journal of Educational Technology* 36, no. 1 (2005): 111–12.

²⁴ T Anderson, "Towards a Theory of Online Learning In T. Anderson (Ed.) *The Theory and Practice of Online Learning* (Pp 45-74). Edmonton, Canada" (Athabasca University Press. Retrieved from <http://biblioteca.uvcv>.

are not overlooked; Instead, greater targets integrate entry-level goals, and scaffolding is given as appropriate ²⁵. As provided by ²⁶, many functional consequences for the improvement of online learning are a significant part of the student-centered framework. These consequences have training include students online how to read, providing resources for enhancing spontaneity and evolving architecture, articulating and maintaining online culture preferences, and seeking to consider all students in online learning environments.

C. Online collaborative

Online collaborative learning as expressed by the current of air stressed learning through victimization completely different sources; a student-centered activity that is conducted online. The key feature of this sort of learning is the interaction among the members of the cluster the head of this sort of learning is copied back to works of ²⁷ with relevancy social art movement. In general, Not solely will collaborative learning need social interactions ²⁸, however additionally the utilization of psychological feature, social, and psychological feature processes. ²⁹6 social art movement is considered the most theoretical framework during this study.

³⁰ Placed stress mostly on collaborative learning outcomes by asking that the analytical reasoning talents of students improved. Several research-backed the beneficial outcome of the acquisition partnership. ³¹ for instance, notice collaboration and efficient consider Wiki understanding and sense of inclusion in a very group of EFL students. Collaboration is generally seen as providing a good result on the social facets of learners. It lets learners withstand the intensive learning process and reach a goal.

D. Whatsapp Messenger

The technology of information and communication (ICT) influences the field of education tremendously. The use of ICTs in education, especially language acquisition and learning, is a constructive reaction to the growth of ICT in the third millennium ³². In the field of ICT, there has been a recent movement called the social network. Many identified the social network and were commonly seen as relating to networked resources that enable individuals to meet, communicate, and exchange thoughts, objects, and interests ³³. This social network has opened up new possibilities for teacher-learner connections and partnerships.

The use of social networks is becoming common in daily communication. In particular, social networking apps such as Facebook, Twitter, Linkedin, and many others have become

cl/site ..., 2008).

²⁵ (Aqda, Hamidi, and Ghorbandordinejad, 2011)

²⁶ (Stodel, Thompson, and MacDonald, 2006)

²⁷ Vygotsky, "Mind in Society (M. Cole, V. John-Steiner, S. Scribner, & E. Soubberman, Eds.)."

²⁸ Barry J Zimmerman, "A Social Cognitive View of Self-Regulated Academic Learning," *Journal of Educational Psychology* 81, no. 3 (1989): 329.

²⁹ Vygotsky, "Mind in Society (M. Cole, V. John-Steiner, S. Scribner, & E. Soubberman, Eds.)."

³⁰ David E Francis, *A Review of Online Collaborative Learning: Theory and Practice*, *Canadian Journal of Learning and Technology / La Revue Canadienne de l'apprentissage et de La Technologie*, vol. 31, 2005, <https://doi.org/10.21432/t2pk6b>.

³¹ You Su et al., "Moving Literature Circles into Wiki-Based Environment: The Role of Online Self-Regulation in EFL Learners' Attitude toward Collaborative Learning," *Computer Assisted Language Learning* 32, no. 5–6 (2019): 556–86, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2018.1527363>.

³² Said Fathy El Said Abdul Fattah, "The Effectiveness of Using WhatsApp Messenger as One of Mobile Learning Techniques to Develop Students' Writing Skills.," *Journal of Education and Practice* 6, no. 32 (2015): 115–27.

³³ Anderson, "Towards a Theory of Online Learning In T. Anderson (Ed.) *The Theory and Practice of Online Learning* (Pp 45-74). Edmonton, Canada."

phenomenally popular in the field of connectivity³⁴. WhatsApp is the latest famous social network. WhatsApp Messenger is a proprietary, multiplatform mobile instant messaging service. Besides text messages, users can also send pictures, video, and audio media messages to each other³⁵. WhatsApp encourages its members to use their Internet access to send each other messages. WhatsApp is like a cell phone messaging service. The prevalence of smartphones is rising and WhatsApp is available for nearly all smartphones.

E. Writing

Writing is one of the most essential skills students must develop in foreign languages.³⁶ notes that trends in ESL and other foreign languages in teaching writing are integrated with other skills particularly listening and speaking. For example, students can gather knowledge from radio, television, journals, the internet, and personally engage with specialists about a related subject as their teachers are asked to write in conjunction with those topics. Writing is the last output after students constantly learn separate acts.³⁷ Specifies that writing is the final result after students practice multiple writing phases independently before. Good writing means good grammar, material, intent, and reader referred to.³⁸ illustrates the phases of learning and give students a better view of the value of writing for good writing.

METHODS

In this study, the researcher used quantitative research that applied a pre-test and post-test plan. (Latief,2013) stated that experimental research is the main research to test theories that relate to cause and effect. This research design wants to know class problems related to language learning. a pre-test was given to students before treatment. after that, the post-test will be given to students to find out how to improve students' skills in writing skills.

The design states that the teacher gives them a pre-test before using online collaborative learning methods, then gives them a post-test after encouraging them to generally use online collaborative learning.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

This section provides careful info and knowledge gathered throughout the data checking procedure. watching the distinction motivation and skill by writing descriptive text before and once mistreatment online collaborative learning by utilizing the t-test. Before conniving the t-test, the analyst tries to the distinctiveness of the data.

³⁴ Akhmad Riyanto, "English Language Learning Using WhatsApp Application," *AkhmadRianto, Love for All, Hatred for None. WordPress, the Splendid Theme*, 2013.

³⁵ Fattah, "The Effectiveness of Using WhatsApp Messenger as One of Mobile Learning Techniques to Develop Students' Writing Skills."

³⁶ Paula Gillespie et al., *Writing Center Research: Extending the Conversation* (Routledge, 2001).

³⁷ Carolyn S Wallace, Brian B Hand, and Vaughan Prain, *Writing and Learning in the Science Classroom*, vol. 23 (Springer Science & Business Media, 2004).

³⁸ Ken Hyland, *Disciplinary Discourses, Michigan Classics Ed.: Social Interactions in Academic Writing* (University of Michigan Press, 2004).

The Analysis of T-test

Table 1 –

Paired Samples Statistics					
		Mean	N	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Pair 1	PRE TEST	60.4063	32	7.65321	1.35291
	POST TEST	84.4688	32	6.08533	1.07574

Illustrations

From the table over, the score of the pre-test and the post-test demonstrated that the mean of the pre-test was 60.4063 and the mean of the post-test was 84.4688. It implies that the score of the post-test was higher than the score of the pre-test.

Table 2 – Paired Samples Correlation

Paired Samples Correlations				
		N	Correlation	Sig.
Pair 1	PRE TEST & POST TEST	32	.772	.000

The table above shows the connection between the pre-test and post-test was $r = 0.772$ with a likelihood (sig) = 0.000. This implies the pre-test and the post-test had a solid relationship since r esteem was near 1. As per ³⁹, $r = 0.10$ was little impact, $r = 0.3$ was medium impact and $r = 0.5$ was huge impact.

Table 3 – Paired Samples Test

Paired Samples Test										
		Paired Differences					t	df	Sig. . (2-tailed)	
		Mean	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference					
					Lower	Upper				
Paired Sample 1	PRE TEST - POST TEST	-24.06250	4.87216	.86128	-25.81910	-22.30590	-27.938	31	.000	

³⁹ Andy Field, *Discovering Statistics Using IBM SPSS Statistics, Statistics*, 2013.

r									
1									

From the table, the noteworthy worth (sig. 2 followed) was 0.000, the worth < 0.05 , subsequently was critical and t acquired was 27.938 at the noteworthy degree of 0.05 and the level of opportunity 31. It implies that there was noteworthy recorded as a hard copy elucidating text utilizing online gamification learning. ⁴⁰ has expressed, "If the value is less than 0.05 then the means of the two conditions are significantly different".

DISCUSSION

The objective of this study is to know the effectiveness of teaching writing after being taught by online collaborative learning at students of MTS Bustanul Ulum. To gain the objectives of the study, the researcher conducts an experimental study with the design pre-experimental research one-group pretest-posttest design. Based on the research method, the study was done in two steps.

In the first step, the researcher knows the students' writing ability by administering the initial test. In the initial test, students are ordered to do a test by working on essay questions. the results of the pre-test scores of all students are below 70. It can be concluded that the writing ability of student MTS. Bustanul Ulum is low. the mean pre-test score was 80.

The second step was giving treatment to the students. The researcher gave two materials "descriptive text and the narrative text" while undergoing treatment with the help of the google classroom application. students are very enthusiastic to learn it.

As previously stated, the T-test was used to verify the major difference in the findings obtained by one party. Analysis of results reveals that the t-count is higher than the t-table (10, 88 > 2, 14). The alternative hypothesis (H_a) is then appropriate and the null hypothesis (H_o) is dismissed. It indicates that there are major variations in scores between students before and after teaching using picture media. The alternative hypothesis (H_a) is supported based on observations and the null hypothesis (H_o) is denied. From the aforementioned description, the usefulness of writing in education and learning has a positive impact on decent writing, making it easy and loves to write without pressure. This can be achieved when knowledge and information can be fully learned and preserved with enjoyable learning.

CONCLUSION

Teaching writing skills through online collaborative learning is effective. Because there is any significant difference in the achievement of the students' score before and after taught by online collaborative learning. The result of static computation using the t-test shown that the result of the pre-test and post-test was 10, 88. The table with a significant level of 5% and df 14 was 2, 14. So, was greater than (10,88 > 2, 14). From the data analyzed above, it can be concluded that H_a was accepted and H_o was rejected.

⁴⁰ Andy Field, *Discovering Statistics Using SPSS (2nd Ed.)*, *Discovering Statistics Using SPSS (2nd Ed.)*, 2005.

REFERENCES

- Al-Rahmi, Waleed, Mohd Shahizan Othman, and Lizawati Mi Yusuf. "The Role of Social Media for Collaborative Learning to Improve Academic Performance of Students and Researchers in Malaysian Higher Education." *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning* 16, no. 4 (2015).
- Alsubaie, Jawaher, and Ali Ashuraidah. "Exploring Writing Individually and Collaboratively Using Google Docs in EFL Contexts." *English Language Teaching* 10, no. 10 (2017): 10. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v10n10p10>.
- Aminloo, Masoumeh Shiri. "The Effect of Collaborative Writing on EFL Learners Writing Ability at Elementary Level." *Journal of Language Teaching and Research* 4, no. 4 (2013): 801–6. <https://doi.org/10.4304/jltr.4.4.801-806>.
- Anderson, T. "Towards a Theory of Online Learning In T. Anderson (Ed.) The Theory and Practice of Online Learning (Pp 45-74). Edmonton, Canada." Athabasca University Press. Retrieved from [http://biblioteca.ucv.cl/site ...](http://biblioteca.ucv.cl/site...), 2008.
- Apsari, Yanuarti. "Reflective Reading Journal in Teaching Writing." *Indonesian EFL Journal* 4, no. 2 (2018): 39. <https://doi.org/10.25134/ieflj.v4i2.1374>.
- Aqda, Mahnaz Fatemi, Farideh Hamidi, and Farhad Ghorbandordinejad. "The Impact of Constructivist and Cognitive Distance Instructional Design on the Learner's Creativity." *Procedia Computer Science* 3 (2011): 260–65.
- Aziz, Imam Nur, and Yuli Ani Setyo Dewi. "The Concept of Language Environment: A Descriptive Study at Madrasah Aliah Keagamaan Gresik." *EDUKASI: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam* 7, no. 2 (2019): 1–23.
- Barkley, Elizabeth F, K Patricia Cross, and Claire H Major. *Collaborative Learning Techniques: A Handbook for College Faculty*. John Wiley & Sons, 2014.
- Bruggen, Jan Van. "Theory and Practice of Online Learning." *British Journal of Educational Technology* 36, no. 1 (2005): 111–12.
- Capdeferro, Neus, and Margarida Romero. "Are Online Learners Frustrated with Collaborative Learning Experiences?" *International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning* 13, no. 2 (2012): 26–44.
- Challob, Ismael, Nadzrah Abu Bakar, and Hafizah Latif. "Collaborative Blended Learning Writing Environment : Effects on EFL Students ' Writing Apprehension and Writing Performance" 9, no. 6 (2016): 229–41. <https://doi.org/10.5539/elt.v9n6p229>.
- Chen, Wenting, and Shulin Yu. "Implementing Collaborative Writing in Teacher- Centered Classroom Contexts : Student Beliefs and Perceptions." *Language Awareness* 0, no. 0 (2019): 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09658416.2019.1675680>.
- Cheng, Xusen, Xueyin Wang, Jianqing Huang, and Alex Zarifis. "An Experimental Study of Satisfaction Response: Evaluation of Online Collaborative Learning." *International Review of Research in Open and Distance Learning* 17, no. 1 (2016): 60–78. <https://doi.org/10.19173/irrodl.v17i1.2110>.
- Fattah, Said Fathy El Said Abdul. "The Effectiveness of Using WhatsApp Messenger as One of Mobile Learning Techniques to Develop Students' Writing Skills." *Journal of Education and Practice* 6, no. 32 (2015): 115–27.
- Field, Andy. *Discovering Statistics Using IBM SPSS Statistics*. Statistics, 2013.
- . *Discovering Statistics Using SPSS (2nd Ed.)*. *Discovering Statistics Using SPSS (2nd Ed.)*, 2005.
- Francis, David E. *A Review of Online Collaborative Learning: Theory and Practice*. *Canadian Journal of Learning and Technology / La Revue Canadienne de l'apprentissage et de La Technologie*. Vol. 31, 2005. <https://doi.org/10.21432/t2pk6b>.
- Gillespie, Paula, Alice Gillam, Lady Falls Brown, and Byron Stay. *Writing Center Research: Extending the Conversation*. Routledge, 2001.

- Hämäläinen, Raija, and Katja Vähäsantanen. "Theoretical and Pedagogical Perspectives on Orchestrating Creativity and Collaborative Learning." *Educational Research Review* 6, no. 3 (2011): 169–84.
- Hyland, Ken. *Disciplinary Discourses, Michigan Classics Ed.: Social Interactions in Academic Writing*. University of Michigan Press, 2004.
- Imam Nur Aziz. "The Concept of Language Environment : A Descriptive Study At Madrasah Aliyah Keagamaan Gresik." *Journal of Chemical Information and Modeling* 53, no. 9 (2013): 1689–99.
- Larreamendy-Joerns, Jorge, and Gaea Leinhardt. "Going the Distance with Online Education." *Review of Educational Research* 76, no. 4 (2006): 567–605.
- Moore, M G, and G Kearsley. "Distance Education: A Systems View of Online Learning (3. Baski). New York: Cengage." *Muhasebe ve Vergi Uygulamaları Dergisi*, 2012.
- Motallebzadeh, Khalil, and Farideh Samadi. "The Effect of Using Online Collaborative Tasks on Incidental Vocabulary Learning of Impulsive vs. Reflective Iranian EFL Learners." *International Journal of Applied Linguistics and English Literature* 6, no. 6 (2017): 127. <https://doi.org/10.7575/aiac.ijalel.v.6n.6p.127>.
- Nykopp, Minna, Miika Marttunen, and Gijsbert Erkens. "Coordinating Collaborative Writing in an Online Environment." *Journal of Computing in Higher Education* 31, no. 3 (2019): 536–56. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12528-018-9203-3>.
- Paulus, Trena M, Rebecca Payne, and Lisa Jahns. "' Am I Making Sense Here?': What Blogging Reveals about Undergraduate Student Understanding." *Educational Psychology & Counseling Publications and Other Works*, 2009, 2.
- Riyanto, Akhmad. "English Language Learning Using WhatsApp Application." *AkhmadRianto, Love for All, Hatred for None. WordPress, the Splendid Theme*, 2013.
- Rizki, Indra, Deyan Nouvaldi, and Yanuarti Apsari. "Teaching Writing Narrative Text By Using Collaborative Learning." *PROJECT (Professional Journal of English Education)* 3, no. 3 (2020): 329. <https://doi.org/10.22460/project.v3i3.p329-336>.
- Stodel, Emma J, Terrie Lynn Thompson, and Colla J MacDonald. "Learners' Perspectives on What Is Missing from Online Learning: Interpretations through the Community of Inquiry Framework." *The International Review of Research in Open and Distributed Learning* 7, no. 3 (2006).
- Su, You, Yanyan Li, Jyh Chong Liang, and Chin Chung Tsai. "Moving Literature Circles into Wiki-Based Environment: The Role of Online Self-Regulation in EFL Learners' Attitude toward Collaborative Learning." *Computer Assisted Language Learning* 32, no. 5–6 (2019): 556–86. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09588221.2018.1527363>.
- Tremblay-Wragg, Emilie, Sara Mathieu Chartier, Élise Labonté-Lemoyne, Catherine Déri, and Marie Eve Gadbois. "Writing More, Better, Together: How Writing Retreats Support Graduate Students through Their Journey." *Journal of Further and Higher Education* 00, no. 00 (2020): 1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0309877X.2020.1736272>.
- Vygotsky, Lev S. "Mind in Society (M. Cole, V. John-Steiner, S. Scribner, & E. Souberman, Eds.)." Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1978.
- Wallace, Carolyn S, Brian B Hand, and Vaughan Prain. *Writing and Learning in the Science Classroom*. Vol. 23. Springer Science & Business Media, 2004.
- Zambrano, Jimmy, Femke Kirschner, John Sweller, and Paul A Kirschner. "Effects of Group Experience and Information Distribution on Collaborative Learning." *Instructional Science*, no. 0123456789 (2019). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11251-019-09495-0>.
- Zimmerman, Barry J. "A Social Cognitive View of Self-Regulated Academic Learning." *Journal of Educational Psychology* 81, no. 3 (1989): 329.